

Before the Building Practitioners Board

Appeal No. A1420

Between: [OMITTED] (the Appellant)

And: The Registrar

In the matter of: An appeal against a decision of the Registrar of Licensed Building Practitioners to decline a Carpentry Licence.

Decision of the Board under section 330(1)(a) of the Building Act 2004

Hearing Location Auckland

Hearing Type: In Person

Hearing and Decision Date: 23 April 2024

Board Members Present:

Ms J Clark, Barrister and Solicitor, Legal Member (Presiding)

Mr D Fabish, LBP, Carpentry and Site AoP 2

Mr P Thompson, LBP, Carpentry and Site AoP 3, Quantity Surveyor

Procedure:

The matter was considered by the Building Practitioners Board (the Board) under the provisions of Part 4 of the Building Act 2004 (the Act), the Licensed Building Practitioners Rules 2007 (the Rules) and the Board's Procedures for the Management of Appeals (the Appeal Procedures).

Decision:

The Board has decided, under section 335 of the Act, to confirm the Registrar's decision.

The Appellant **will not** be granted a Carpentry Licence.

Contents

Summary of the Board’s Appeal Decision	2
The Board	2
Procedure on Appeal	2
The Registrar’s Decision	2
The Appeal	3
The Hearing	3
The Purposes of the Licensing Regime	4
Board’s Conclusion and Reasoning	5
Board’s Order	5
Costs and Publication	5
Costs.....	5
Publication	6
Right of Appeal	6

Summary of the Board’s Appeal Decision

- [1] The Board has confirmed the Registrar’s decision. The Appellant is **not granted** a Carpentry Licence.

The Board

- [2] The Board is a statutory body established under the Building Act.¹ Its functions include hearing appeals against certain decisions of the Registrar in accordance with subpart 2 of Part 4 of the Act.

Procedure on Appeal

- [3] Under section 335 of the Act, an appeal proceeds by way of rehearing. On hearing an appeal, the Board may confirm, reverse, or modify the decision or action appealed against. The Board may also make any other decision or take any other action that the decision maker (the Registrar) could have made. The Board cannot review any part of a decision or action not appealed against.

The Registrar’s Decision

- [4] To become licensed, an applicant person must satisfy the Registrar that they meet the applicable minimum standard for the class or classes of licence applied for. ²The minimum standard is prescribed by rule 4 of the Rules. It states:

¹ Section 341 of the Act.

² Refer rule 9(1)(a) of the Rules

4 MINIMUM STANDARD OF COMPETENCE FOR EACH CLASS OF LICENCE

- (1) *The minimum standard of competence for a class of licence is meeting all of the competencies set out for that class of licence in Schedule 1.*
- (2) *In determining whether a person meets a competency, regard must be had to the extent to which the person meets the performance indicators set out for that competency in Schedule 1.*

[5] Under rule 12 of the Rules, the Registrar must make a decision on the application. The Registrar's decision to grant or decline a licence must be informed by an assessor's recommendation.³

[6] On 15 February 2024, the Registrar informed the Appellant that his application had been declined. The Appellant was informed of his right to appeal the decision.

The Appeal

[7] On 5 March 2024, the Appellant filed an appeal with the Board against the Registrar's decision.

[8] The Board was provided with the original licensing application and the assessor's report and recommendation, which noted the Appellant had failed to demonstrate the following competencies for the class of license applied for:

- (a) Competency 3: Carrying out planning and scheduling for carpentry work.
- (b) Competency 4: Carry out carpentry work.

[9] Under section 335(4) of the Act, the Board must not review any part of a decision or action not appealed against. On that basis, and on the basis of the Report, the matters under appeal were those noted above.

[10] The burden of proof lies with the Appellant. It is for the Appellant to provide sufficient evidence to establish, on the balance of probabilities, that he meets sufficient of the performance indicators for those competencies that are being appealed to be granted a licence. If the Registrar appears at an appeal hearing,⁴ the matter proceeds using an adversarial process.

[11] The Registrar did not seek leave to appear.

The Hearing

[12] Prior to the hearing, the Appellant provided further evidence to support the appeal. This included photographs of work the Appellant said he was involved in, explanations of various aspects of carpentry work as highlighted in the competencies and details on how he considered he met the required competencies.

³ Rules 10 and 11 of the Rules

⁴ The Registrar may seek leave to appear and be heard under clause 2.9.16(a) of the appeal procedures either in person or by legal counsel.

- [13] At the hearing, the Appellant did not make an opening submission.
- [14] The Board questioned the Appellant as regards the performance indicators in Schedule 1 of the Rules for those competencies that were appealed.
- [15] The Board began by asking the Appellant about his quantity surveying qualification and his work experience. The Appellant outlined that he had been involved in approximately 30 new house builds. His building experience was from the framing stage only. He had not done any renovation work.
- [16] The Board used a mock scenario of a proposed house demolition and a replacement new house build based on a cross-section plan which was shown to the Appellant. The questions focussed on the requirements of the competencies.
- [17] The Appellant had indicated that he had two witnesses who were available to be called during the hearing. The Appellant was given the opportunity to call the witnesses and decided not to do so.

The Purposes of the Licensing Regime

- [18] The Building (Definition of Restricted Building Work) Order 2011 (New Zealand) stipulates that design work and building work on the primary structure and external moisture-management system of a house or a small-to-medium apartment building is restricted building work. Restricted building work on applies to work that is carried out or supervised under a building consent⁵.
- [19] Under section 84 of the Act:
- All restricted building work must be carried out or supervised by a licensed building practitioner [who is licensed] to carry out or supervise the work.*
- [20] Given the above provisions, a person who wishes to carry out or supervise restricted building work, other than as an owner builder, must be licensed.
- [21] The introduction of the licensed building practitioner regime was aimed at improving the skills and knowledge of those involved in residential construction. The following was stated as the intention of the enabling legislation⁶:

The Government's goal is a more efficient and productive sector that stands behind the quality of its work; a sector with the necessary skills and capability to build it right first time and that takes prides in its work; a sector that delivers good-quality, affordable homes and buildings and contributes to a prosperous economy; a well-informed sector that shares information and quickly identifies and corrects problems; and a sector where everyone involved in building work knows what they are accountable for and what they rely on others for.

⁵ Refer section 401B of the Act.

⁶ Hansard volume 669: Page 16053

[22] And, as was noted by the responsible Minister during the first reading of the legislative provisions that established it:⁷

A robust licensing scheme with a critical mass of licensed builders means consumers can have confidence that their homes will be built right first time.

[23] Within that context, it is important that the competence of those who seek to be licensed is thoroughly assessed so as to ensure that the legislative purposes of licensing are advanced, consumers are protected, and buildings are designed and constructed in a manner that makes them safe and healthy.

Board's Conclusion and Reasoning

[24] On the basis of the evidence received and having taken into consideration the purposes of the licensing regime, the Board has decided that it will confirm the decision appealed against.

[25] In making its decision, the Board noted the Appellant was not able to demonstrate knowledge or experience of key competencies such as – “constructing concrete ... foundations”, “preparing a site for construction” and “constructing, setting out and erecting floor, wall and roof frames and trusses”. He was not familiar with methods for checking the framing was square, straight, and plumb. He could not answer questions about the role of a structural engineer in a situation where the foundation and framing did not align.

[26] The Appellant is encouraged to gain more experience and knowledge. This will provide the Appellant with exposure to and knowledge of the skills necessary to carry out and fully understand all stages and aspects of residential construction.

Board's Order

[27] Pursuant to s335(3) of the Act, the Board confirms the Registrar's decision appealed against.

Costs and Publication

Costs

[28] Under section 338(4) of the Act the Board may order any party to the appeal to pay to any other party to the appeal any or all of the costs incurred by the other party in respect of the appeal.

[29] The Board has adopted the approach taken by the District Court to costs on appeal.

[30] Based on the above, the Board's costs order requires neither party to pay costs to the other party.

⁷ Hansard volume 669: Page 16053

Publication

[31] Section 339 of the Act provides:

339 Orders as to publication of names


- (1) *On an appeal under this subpart, the appeal authority may, if in its opinion it is proper to do so, prohibit the publication of the name or particulars of the affairs of a licensed building practitioner or any other person.*
- (2) *In deciding whether to make an order under subsection (1), the appeal authority must have regard to—*
 - (a) *the interests of any person (including, without limitation, the privacy of any complainant); and*
 - (b) *the public interest.*
- (3) *If the appeal authority prohibits the publication of the name or particulars of the affairs of a licensed building practitioner, the Registrar must remove the name or particulars of the affairs of that licensed building practitioner from the register in relation to the matter under appeal to the extent necessary to reflect the appeal authority's prohibition on publication.*

[32] Based on the above, the Board **will not** prohibit publication.

Right of Appeal

[33] The right to appeal a Board decision of this type is provided for in section 330(2) of the Actⁱ.

Signed and dated this 26th day of April 2024



Mrs J Clark
Presiding Member

ⁱ **Section 330 Right of appeal**

- (2) *A person may appeal to a District Court against any decision of the Board—*
 - (a) *made by it on an appeal brought under subsection (1)*

Section 331 Time in which appeal must be brought

An appeal must be lodged—

- (a) *within 20 working days after notice of the decision or action is communicated to the appellant;*
or

- (b) *within any further time that the appeal authority allows on application made before or after the period expires.*