

Before the Building Practitioners Board

Appeal No. 1412

Between: [OMITTED] (the Appellant)

And: The Registrar

In the matter of: An appeal against a decision of the Registrar of Licensed Building Practitioners to decline a Carpentry Licence.

Decision of the Board under section 330(1)(a) of the Building Act 2004

Hearing Location By Audio Visual Link

Hearing Type: In Person

Hearing and Decision: 7 February 2024

Board Members Present:

Mrs F Pearson-Green, LBP, Design AoP 2, Deputy Chair (Presiding)

Mr D Fabish, LBP, Carpentry and Site AoP 2

Mr P Thompson, LBP, Carpentry and Site AoP 3, Quantity Surveyor

Procedure:

The matter was considered by the Building Practitioners Board (the Board) under the provisions of Part 4 of the Building Act 2004 (the Act), the Licensed Building Practitioners Rules 2007 (the Rules) and the Board's Procedures for the Management of Appeals (the Appeal Procedures).

Decision:

The Board has decided, under section 335 of the Act, to confirm the Registrar's decision. The Appellant **will not** be granted a Carpentry Licence.

.

Contents

Summary of the Board’s Appeal Decision	2
The Board	2
Procedure on Appeal	2
The Registrar’s Decision	2
The Appeal	3
The Hearing	4
Board’s Conclusion and Reasoning	5
Board’s Order	6
Costs and Publication	6
Costs.....	6
Publication	6
Right of Appeal	7

Summary of the Board’s Appeal Decision

[1] The Board has decided that the Registrar’s decision is affirmed. The Appellant is **not** granted a Carpentry Licence.

The Board

[2] The Board is a statutory body established under the Building Act.¹ Its functions include hearing appeals against certain decisions of the Registrar in accordance with subpart 2 of Part 4 of the Act.

Procedure on Appeal

[3] Under section 335 of the Act, an appeal proceeds by way of rehearing. On hearing an appeal, the Board may confirm, reverse, or modify the decision or action appealed against. The Board may also make any other decision or take any other action that the decision maker (the Registrar) could have made. The Board cannot review any part of a decision or action not appealed against.

The Registrar’s Decision

[4] To become licensed, an applicant person must satisfy the Registrar that they meet the applicable minimum standard for the class or classes of licence applied for. ²The minimum standard is prescribed by rule 4 of the Rules. It states:

¹ Section 341 of the Act.

² Refer rule 9(1)(a) of the Rules

4 MINIMUM STANDARD OF COMPETENCE FOR EACH CLASS OF LICENCE

- (1) *The minimum standard of competence for a class of licence is meeting all of the competencies set out for that class of licence in Schedule 1.*
- (2) *In determining whether a person meets a competency, regard must be had to the extent to which the person meets the performance indicators set out for that competency in Schedule 1.*

[5] Under rule 12 of the Rules, the Registrar must make a decision on the application. The Registrar's decision to grant or decline a licence must be informed by an assessor's recommendation.³

[6] On 14 November 2023, the Registrar informed the Appellant that his application had been declined. The Appellant was informed of his right to appeal the decision.

The Appeal

[7] On 30 November 2023, the Appellant filed an appeal with the Board against the Registrar's decision.

[8] The Board was provided with the original licensing application and the assessor's report and recommendation, which noted the Appellant had failed to demonstrate the following competencies for the class of license applied for:

- a. *Competency 1: Demonstrate knowledge of the regulatory environment of the building construction industry.*
- b. *Competency 2: Demonstrate knowledge of current building and trade practice.*
- c. *Competency 3: Carry out planning and scheduling for carpentry work.*
- d. *Competency 4: Carry out carpentry work.*

[9] Under section 335(4) of the Act, the Board must not review any part of a decision or action not appealed against. On that basis, and on the basis of the Report, the matters under appeal were those noted above.

[10] The burden of proof lies with the Appellant. It is for the Appellant to provide sufficient evidence to establish, on the balance of probabilities, that he meets sufficient of the performance indicators for those competencies that are being appealed to be granted a licence. If the Registrar appears at an appeal hearing,⁴ the matter proceeds using an adversarial process.

[11] The Registrar did not seek leave to appear.

³ Rules 10 and 11 of the Rules

⁴ The Registrar may seek leave to appear and be heard under clause 2.9.16(a) of the appeal procedures either in person or by legal counsel.

The Hearing

- [12] Prior to the hearing, the Appellant provided further evidence to support the appeal. This included photos, checklists and task sheets to show his involvement in the construction of a Kainga Ora project.
- [13] At the hearing, the Appellant made an opening submission summarising his building background both overseas and since arriving in New Zealand in 2019. The Appellant stated that he had achieved a BCITO Level 3 qualification for frames and trusses in 2023.
- [14] The Board questioned the Appellant as regards the performance indicators in Schedule 1 of the Rules for those competencies that were appealed. The Appellant was not able to answer or fully and correctly answer questions relating to Competency 1: *demonstrate knowledge of the regulatory environment of the building construction industry*. To be granted a carpentry licence that is being appealed against the Appellant is required to meet all four competencies.

The Purposes of the Licensing Regime

- [15] The Building (Definition of Restricted Building Work) Order 2011 (New Zealand) stipulates that design work and building work on the primary structure and external moisture-management system of a house or a small-to-medium apartment building is Restricted Building Work. Restricted Building Work on applies to work that is carried out or supervised under a building consent⁵.
- [16] Under section 84 of the Act:
- All Restricted Building Work must be carried out or supervised by a Licensed Building Practitioner [who is licensed] to carry out or supervise the work.*
- [17] Given the above provisions, a person who wishes to carry out or supervise Restricted Building Work, other than as an owner builder, must be licensed.
- [18] The introduction of the Licensed Building Practitioner regime was aimed at improving the skills and knowledge of those involved in residential construction. The following was stated as the intention to the enabling legislation⁶:

The Government's goal is a more efficient and productive sector that stands behind the quality of its work; a sector with the necessary skills and capability to build it right first time and that takes prides in its work; a sector that delivers good-quality, affordable homes and buildings and contributes to a prosperous economy; a well-informed sector that shares information and quickly identifies and corrects problems; and a sector where everyone involved in building work knows what they are accountable for and what they rely on others for.

⁵ Refer section 401B of the Act.

⁶ Hansard volume 669: Page 16053

- [19] And, as was noted by the responsible Minister during the first reading of the legislative provisions that established it:⁷

A robust licensing scheme with a critical mass of licensed builders means consumers can have confidence that their homes will be built right first time.

- [20] Within that context, it is important that the competence of those who seek to be licensed is thoroughly assessed so as to ensure that the legislative purposes of licensing are advanced, consumers are protected, and buildings are designed and constructed in a manner that makes them safe and healthy.

Board's Conclusion and Reasoning

- [21] On the basis of the evidence received and having taken into consideration the purposes of the licensing regime, the Board has decided that it will confirm the decision appealed against
- [22] In making its decision, the Board noted the Appellant had a limited level of knowledge regarding competency 1. However, his knowledge did have large gaps and lacked depth in many of the areas, such as understanding when a Building Consent was required and when Schedule 1 of the Building Act may apply. The Appellant had limited knowledge with regards to the following conditions of a Building Consent, such as understanding inspections required and from whom, and the amendments and minor variations process.
- [23] The Appellant could not explain the information that can be found in the NZS 3604:2011 and E2/AS1 and how this information is applied in practice. The Appellant explained that NZS3604 was to maintain structural strength, durability and stability, and E2 was to stop moisture from entering the house. He was unable to provide any examples of what details or information could be found in either document.
- [24] The Appellant could not fully identify what types of Restricted Building Work that can be carried out with a carpentry licence, nor could he list all the seven licence classes.
- [25] The Appellant appears to have limited carpentry knowledge; he would appear to be reliant on information and detail that he has been told by his project and site managers, engineers or the council inspectors. The Appellant's main focus was that if you make a change it is best to be over the minimum standard, and if it is acceptable with everyone, it should be all right.
- [26] The Appellant's experience appears to be lacking in some of the areas of construction required for a carpentry licence. His experience is limited, often to specific subcontracted areas of construction.
- [27] The Appellant could not explain a Record of Work.

⁷ Hansard volume 669: Page 16053

[28] The Board recommends that the Appellant focuses on obtaining more experience under supervision and mentorship. In addition, the Board recommends that the Appellant gain a greater depth of knowledge in all the areas of competencies of a carpentry licence before reapplying.

Board's Order

[29] Pursuant to s335(3) of the Act, the Board confirms the Registrar's decision appealed against.

Costs and Publication

Costs

[30] Under section 338(4) of the Act the Board may order any party to the appeal to pay to any other party to the appeal any or all of the costs incurred by the other party in respect of the appeal.

[31] The Board has adopted the approach taken by the District Court to costs on appeal.

[32] Based on the above, the Board's costs order is that neither party is to pay costs to the other party.

Publication

[33] Section 339 of the Act provides:

339 Orders as to publication of names

(1) *On an appeal under this subpart, the appeal authority may, if in its opinion it is proper to do so, prohibit the publication of the name or particulars of the affairs of a Licensed Building Practitioner or any other person.*

(2) *In deciding whether to make an order under subsection (1), the appeal authority must have regard to—*

(a) *the interests of any person (including, without limitation, the privacy of any complainant); and*

(b) *the public interest.*

(3) *If the appeal authority prohibits the publication of the name or particulars of the affairs of a licensed building practitioner, the Registrar must remove the name or particulars of the affairs of that Licensed Building Practitioner from the register in relation to the matter under appeal to the extent necessary to reflect the appeal authority's prohibition on publication.*

[34] Based on the above, the Board **will not** order further publication.

Right of Appeal

[35] The right to appeal a Board decision of this type is provided for in section 330(2) of the Actⁱ.

Signed and dated this 27th day of February 2024



Mrs F Pearson-Green
Presiding Member

ⁱ **Section 330 Right of appeal**

(2) A person may appeal to a District Court against any decision of the Board—
(a) made by it on an appeal brought under subsection (1)

Section 331 Time in which appeal must be brought

An appeal must be lodged—

- (a) within 20 working days after notice of the decision or action is communicated to the appellant; or
- (b) within any further time that the appeal authority allows on application made before or after the period expires.