

## **Before the Building Practitioners Board**

	BPB Complaint No. C2-01688
Licensed Building Practitioner:	Ronald Carmichael (the Respondent)
Licence Number:	BP 114008
Licence(s) Held:	Carpentry

---

### **Penalty Decision of the Board under section 318 of the Building Act 2004**

---

Complaint or Board Inquiry	Complaint
Hearing Location	Christchurch
Hearing Type:	In Person
Hearing Date:	23 January 2018
Substantive Decision Date:	1 March 2018
Penalty Decision Date:	11 April 2018
Board Members Present	
	Chris Preston (Presiding)
	Mel Orange, Legal Member
	Brian Nightingale, Registered Quantity Surveyor and Registered Construction Manager
	Catherine Taylor
	Faye Pearson-Green, LBP Design AOP 2

#### **Procedure:**

The matter was considered by the Building Practitioners Board (the Board) under the provisions of Part 4 of the Building Act 2004 (the Act), the Building Practitioners (Complaints and Disciplinary Procedures) Regulations 2008 (the Complaints Regulations) and the Board's Complaints and Inquiry Procedures.

## Contents

<b>Introduction</b> .....	2
<b>Penalty</b> .....	2
<b>Costs</b> .....	3
<b>Publication of Name</b> .....	3
<b>Section 318 Order</b> .....	3
<b>Right of Appeal</b> .....	3

## Introduction

- [1] This penalty decision arises out of the Board's substantive decision in which it found that the Respondent had committed the following disciplinary offence(s):
- (a) carried out or supervised building work or building inspection work in a negligent or incompetent manner (s 317(1)(b) of the Act);
  - (b) has failed, without good reason, in respect of a building consent that relates to restricted building work that he or she is to carry out (other than as an owner-builder) or supervise, or has carried out (other than as an owner-builder) or supervised, (as the case may be), to provide the persons specified in section 88(2) with a record of work, on completion of the restricted building work, in accordance with section 88(1) (s 317(1)(da)(ii) of the Act); and
  - (c) has conducted himself or herself in a manner that brings, or is likely to bring, the regime under this Act for licensed building practitioners into disrepute (s 317(1)(i) of the Act).
- [2] Having found that one or more of the grounds in section 317 applies the Board must, under section 318 of the Act<sup>i</sup>, consider the appropriate disciplinary penalty, whether the Respondent should be ordered to pay any costs and whether the decision should be published.
- [3] In its substantive decision the Board set out its indicative position as regards penalty, costs and publication and invited the Respondent to make written submissions on those matters.
- [4] On 22 March 2018, the Board received the Respondent's submissions. It has considered them and made the following decisions.

## Penalty

- [5] The Board's initial view was that a fine of \$5,000 was the appropriate penalty for the disciplinary offence. The Board initially considered cancellation of the Respondent's licence but reduced the penalty to a fine.
- [6] The Respondent has submitted that he has left New Zealand and has no intention of returning and has asked that his licence be cancelled. He has also submitted that he has no ability to pay a fine.

- [7] Having considered the submissions received the Board has decided to cancel the Respondent's licence and to order that he not be able to apply to be relicensed for a period of 2 years.

### **Costs**

- [8] The Board's initial view was that \$2,000 in costs was appropriate. No submissions were made as regards costs but the Respondent's claimed impecuniosity is noted. An order for costs ensures those that pay license fees do not bear the full burden of disciplinary matters. Given this the amount of costs will not be changed.

### **Publication of Name**

- [9] The Board's initial view was there were good reasons to further publish the matter.
- [10] The Respondent has submitted that as he has left New Zealand publication is not required and that publication will only serve to embarrassing him and his family.
- [11] The effect of publication on persons other than the Respondent is a matter that can be taken into account when considering publication. Potential embarrassment is not, however, a reason to not publish. The publication order set out in the substantive decision will not be changed. It was that the matter be published in Code Words and on the Board's website. The publication is to focus on the Board's interpretation of the term building work and its extension as a result of the introduction of Part 4A of the Act to pre contractual matters.

### **Section 318 Order**

- [12] For the reasons set out above, the Board directs that:

**Penalty:** Pursuant to s 318(1)(a)(i) of the Act, the Respondent's licence is cancelled and the Registrar is directed to remove the Respondent's name from the register of Licensed Building Practitioners and pursuant to s 318(1)(a)(ii) of the Act the Board orders that the Respondent may not apply to be relicensed before the expiry of 24 months.

**Costs:** Pursuant to s 318(4) of the Act, the Respondent is ordered to pay costs of \$2,000 (GST included) towards the costs of, and incidental to, the inquiry of the Board.

**Publication:** The Registrar shall record the Board's action in the Register of Licensed Building Practitioners in accordance with s 301(1)(iii) of the Act.

**In terms of section 318(5) of the Act, there will be action taken to publicly notify the Board's action.**

- [13] The Respondent should note that the Board may, under section 319 of the Act, suspend or cancel a licensed building practitioner's licence if fines or costs imposed as a result of disciplinary action are not paid.

### **Right of Appeal**

- [14] The right to appeal Board decisions is provided for in s 330(2) of the Act<sup>ii</sup>.

Signed and dated this 11<sup>th</sup> day of April 2018



**Chris Preston**  
Presiding Member

---

<sup>i</sup> **Section 318 of the Act**

- (1) *In any case to which section 317 applies, the Board may*
  - (a) *do both of the following things:*
    - (i) *cancel the person's licensing, and direct the Registrar to remove the person's name from the register; and*
    - (ii) *order that the person may not apply to be relicensed before the expiry of a specified period:*
  - (b) *suspend the person's licensing for a period of no more than 12 months or until the person meets specified conditions relating to the licensing (but, in any case, not for a period of more than 12 months) and direct the Registrar to record the suspension in the register:*
  - (c) *restrict the type of building work or building inspection work that the person may carry out or supervise under the person's licensing class or classes and direct the Registrar to record the restriction in the register:*
  - (d) *order that the person be censured:*
  - (e) *order that the person undertake training specified in the order:*
  - (f) *order that the person pay a fine not exceeding \$10,000.*
- (2) *The Board may take only one type of action in subsection 1(a) to (d) in relation to a case, except that it may impose a fine under subsection (1)(f) in addition to taking the action under subsection (1)(b) or (d).*
- (3) *No fine may be imposed under subsection (1)(f) in relation to an act or omission that constitutes an offence for which the person has been convicted by a court.*
- (4) *In any case to which section 317 applies, the Board may order that the person must pay the costs and expenses of, and incidental to, the inquiry by the Board.*
- (5) *In addition to requiring the Registrar to notify in the register an action taken by the Board under this section, the Board may publicly notify the action in any other way it thinks fit."*

<sup>ii</sup> **Section 330 Right of appeal**

- (2) *A person may appeal to a District Court against any decision of the Board—*
  - (b) *to take any action referred to in section 318.*

**Section 331 Time in which appeal must be brought**

*An appeal must be lodged—*

- (a) *within 20 working days after notice of the decision or action is communicated to the appellant; or*
- (b) *within any further time that the appeal authority allows on application made before or after the period expires.*